
*Zahid Yousaf**
*Mughees Uddin Sheikh***

Treatment of Terrorism Issue in Pakistani Minorities Press

ABSTRACT

Terrorism has become a serious issue throughout the globe particularly after 9/11 incidents in the United States, these incidents changed the situation as United States announced to start a war against terrorism along with the help of its allies across the world including Pakistan. Media being an important stake holder also protested against the terrorist incidents. The Pakistani Minorities' Press unlike other media also showed involvement in the form of coverage to the terrorism issue, initially there was a mixed stance regarding the involvement of Pakistan in this war but with the passage of time Pakistani media and particularly minorities' press started favoring the state policy on war against terrorism. The recent study aims to find out the treatment of the Pakistani Minorities' Press while covering the terrorism from September 2001 to December 2006. In the study Agenda Setting Theory of media was used determining the Media

* Associate Professor/Chairperson, Centre for Media and Communication Studies, University of Gujrat, Gujrat, Pakistan

** Dean, School of Media & Communication Studies, University of Central Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan

Agenda using content analysis technique to analyze the contents of the selected Pakistani Minorities' Press. The results of the study showed that as a whole the Minorities' Press from Pakistan favored the Pakistani government's policy on the terrorism issue.

Key Words: terrorism, newspapers, agenda setting, media agenda, content analysis, magazines, war on terrorism, minorities' press.

Introduction

Today media has got an important position at national and international level and is considered as an influential tool of information and education across the world, all the issues are discussed in media where people not only get information but also seek guidance. Media has become a key player at international level because it keeps people informed about all contemporary issues; moreover reliance over media is increased to disseminate the peoples' voices at one end and to highlight the activities of government and policy makers on the other. Media in Pakistan has shown a rapid growth in past years in the print and electronic media industry, a large number of television channels are introduced including news, entertainment and religious channels in the country. A number of radio stations are also working in the country producing variety of content. Similarly in print media a number of newspapers and magazines are there at regional and national level in multiple languages. These mediums are producing a variety of content in almost all fields of life including issues related to minorities' in main stream

electronic and print media but there are minorities' based television channels, radio stations, newspapers and magazines as well where the issues related to minorities are discussed. The minorities' issues are discussed freely in the television channels, radio stations, newspapers and magazines of the minorities' in Pakistan according their own interests and will without facing any state pressure enjoying freedom of press in the country. Minorities press is playing a key role in highlighting and discussing their issues as well.

The current study that is focused on the editorial treatment of the terrorism issue in Pakistani Minorities' Press because terrorism is not only a national or regional issue but has become a global issue after the 9/11 incidents in the United States. This incident turned focus of the international media, so this issue also grabbed attention of the Pakistani media as well and among Pakistani media the minorities' press also focused on the terrorism issue. In the current study the researcher intends to study that how the minorities' press in Pakistan has focused on the terrorism issue during the selected time period as the issue got a global importance particularly after 9/11 incidents in United States which lead towards a global war against terrorism. The study is focused on the editorials and articles of the Pakistani minorities' press during September 2001 and December 2006.

The minorities press was taken from all major minorities groups representing Christians, Ahmadi, Hindu, Parsi and Bhai community. There were six newspapers and magazines representing the Christian community, four representing the Ahmadi community whereas one each was representing the rest including Hindu community, Parsi community and the Bhai community during the selected time period. The

selected minorities' press include dailies, weekly, fortnightly, monthly and quarterly newspapers and magazines including Daily Aftab, Christian Voice that is a weekly publication, a fortnightly publication as Catholic Naqeeb, monthly publications Shahdab and Kalam-e-Haq, a quarterly publication Al-Mushir. Daily publication Al-Fazal, Monthly Khalid, Ansaar ullah, Misbah and Prem Sagar. Weekly Parsi publication Sansar n loke sevak whereas a Monthly Nafaha during selected time period. The focus of the study is to examine that how the above mentioned newspapers and magazines of the minorities' have covered the terrorism issue during the selected time period.

Hypotheses:

1. The minorities' press has supported the government stance on the terrorism issue.
2. Articles of the selected press are more favorable while showing government stance on terrorism issue than the editorials.
3. The articles and editorials are more in number that are supportive towards government stance on terrorism than the articles and editorials that oppose the said stance.
4. A nationalist approach exists while addressing the terrorism issue in selected minorities' press.

Literature Review

Journalism is the art of communicating and conveying the message using the communication means of media such as the print media including newspapers and magazines, the electronic media based on television and radio and the latest mean of new media where online communication is possible using the internet facility. People are informed about certain

events and happenings around the world and they are entertained as well using these mediums. Terrorism refers to the use of violence and killings of the people who are innocent and are not involved in any type.

As far as terrorism in Pakistan is concerned a number of researchers and scholars have worked on the terrorism issue particularly after the September 2001 terrorists attacks in the United States of America which is considered as the world's biggest power and it always enjoyed a prominent position in at the global scenario. It was beyond the thoughts that terrorist attacks will be witnessed in the United States. According to Scheuer (2005) United States mostly supported the Islamic States for gaining various interests which was facing criticism of Al-Qaida the outfit involved in terrorism in United States. In Pakistan the terrorism was observed at broader level particularly after the 9/11 incidents in the United States when Pakistan supported the United States in war against terrorism. Terrorism is taken as an act of crime which claims the human lives or the lives of innocent people for no reason or victimizing the innocent people to torture, making the people hostage to threaten the different stakeholders in the countries (United Nations, 2001). Further terrorism refers the claiming of the innocent citizen's lives for gaining vested interests by some groups. The study by Charles (2002) diverts attention towards the important matter of terrorism that it is a comprehensive use of force which lead to the violence targeting the common citizens of the world. Taliban and such mind sets in the tribal areas of Pakistan are referred to such people who intend to continue such activities to maintain or hold terror in the region.

In 2001 attacks on the US were made and Pakistan joined the US led war against terror after the September 11, 2001

(9/11) attacks in the United States when US biggest buildings in New York and its defence centre Pentagon was targeted by the terrorists and the group named as Al-Qaeda was said as responsible for the attacks and was said that the terrorists were hidden in Afghanistan, the neighbour of Pakistan so the war on terror was a major event to be covered by the international media but Pakistani media focused on this war on terror to greater extent showing maximum involvement because of being the neighbours with Afghanistan where the war on terror was operational, minorities' press also played an important role while covering the issue (Ali & Shahid, 2012). The US leadership asked Pakistan for its help in the war against terrorism and if Pakistan will not help the US, it will send Pakistan back to the Stone Age (Aziz, 2011; Ali & Shahid, 2012; Yousaf & Ali, 2012; Musharaff, 2007) so the Pakistani press including minorities press showed interest in the coverage of terrorism issue.

According to Hoffman (2006) terrorist activities are there as a play on theater which are planned activities to target the innocent people for getting the prominent position on media which is a practice being observed since long time, these activities are also for gaining the media coverage on one end and on the other end to send the particular messages and demands to the concerned groups or authorities. Al-Qaida is among such terrorist organizations which actively uses and focuses on media to be on the screen as a number of people including Osama Bin Ladin who is claimed as master mind of the terrorist attacks in United States also focus on media to send their messages to the targeted groups, the rely on media is very important for such extremist organizations and mind sets to achieve their desired goals (Gerges, 2005). In such manner media and

terrorist activities and terrorists are linked with one another in any way that terrorists want media coverage to show their activities to the world for meeting their interests.

Ali et. al (2013) examining the coverage of the Pak-US relations regarding the issue of counter terrorism in the US magazines by the content analysis technique focusing on the objectives to examine the portrayal of the US press regarding war on terrorism, image of Pakistan and to know the direction of the Pak-US relations in the US press. The categories related to the US policy regarding war on terror, military strategy against terrorism, economic aid and social development in Pakistan were focused. The study concludes that the interests of the US are the priority and US media portray those countries positively where its interests are present further the study concludes that the US media has shown more pro-US coverage than pro-Pakistan coverage despite the efforts of Pakistan in the war against terror and the military operation against terrorists in tribal areas of Pakistan. Yousaf, Ali & Ahmed (2013) discussing the coverage the factors like Taliban, Al-Qaeda, Afghanistan and war on terrorism were discussed in the study, the said issues were checked under the three directions favourable, unfavourable and balanced. The Pakistani press has shown the more unsatisfied behaviour regarding the said issues including terrorism.

While discussing the journalistic practices and responsibilities it is discussed that journalists cover terrorism and terror related issues showing more interest than rest of the matters (Hanitzch, 2004). The journalists claim that they cover such stories because of the victimization of the people and they are in miserable conditions due to the terrorism or the violence moreover the terrorism issues are the issues of

the vulnerable groups which face lot of pains (Richter,1999). In the view of Kellner (1992) the reporting during gulf war was not based on neutrality and biasness by the major media stakeholders from west was there keeping certain thing in front which were related to personal gains, similarly media focuses on what is suitable to media organizations while covering terrorism and terrorists activities whereas discard rest of the matter which is having less concern according to them, Wolfsfield (1999) claims that media covers keeping their own interests in front which meets the ideologies or the editorial policies of the media organizations as more favorable space was given to the militants and extremists by the media in middle east rather the efforts of peace which is not an appreciable move by media. So, media should show sense of responsibility while covering issues particularly terrorism related issues keeping the facts and ground realities in front. The study in hand aims to determine that terrorism is the most important issue to be focused and covered by media of the world but Pakistani press is important to be discussed because Pakistan is the next door neighbor of the country where a global war on terror is continued. So, the study aims to explore that how Pakistani minorities' press covered the issue of terrorism.

Theoretical Framework

In the present study the theoretical framework includes the Theory of Agenda Setting, Agenda Setting theory is used for the current study as this theory discusses the particular agendas like media agenda that what is the policy of media while discussing certain issues, the public agenda that what is the public stance on certain events, issues and happenings and the policy agenda that what is the agenda

or mindset of the policy makers regarding certain issues or events. So, all three agendas are considered under the agenda setting theory. In agenda setting concept of media the idea that the news media by its display of the news and different events come to determine the issues what the public think and talk about. So, a close relationship is there between both the agendas which points out towards the notion that mass media attention to any issue provides a platform to enhance its importance to the public.

Cohen (1963) cited in Tankard (1992) states that "It may not be successful much of the time in telling people what to think but it is stunningly successful in telling its readers what to think about". Here the media agenda is focused that how the minorities' press has covered the terrorism issue that has become a very common issue after September 2001 attacks in United States as result a global war on terror starts and Pakistan became a key ally of United States in this war against terrorism. The current study is focused to determine the media agenda regarding terrorism issue in Pakistani minorities' newspapers and magazines.

Methodology

The current study on the treatment of terrorism issue in Pakistani minorities' press is focused to determine that how the media of the Pakistani religious minorities has addressed the terrorism issue as the issue is considered as a major issue of the time. Content analysis method of mass communication and media studies is used in the study because this method checks that how the content of any particular media is used and how the issues are covered in the selected media, here the terrorism issue in the selected

minorities press from Pakistan is addressed that how the media Has covered the terrorism issue from September 2001 to December 2006. Content analysis method of media is a method which allows the researchers to analyze the valid inferences from the text or media content under analysis (Weber, 1990), the media content may be from all types of mass media including print, electronic and online media. Content analysis technique in mass communication studies is a systematic, objective as well as quantitative explanation of the manifest content in the communication studies (Berelson, 1952). The method allows both qualitative and quantitative methods or the triangulation is there in the content analysis studies. Universe of the study determines the boundaries or the limitations of any study to specify the body of content that is to be considered which also requires a suitable definition of the population that is relevant as well and operational.

To identify the topic under discussion, the area and the selected time period the researcher provides the basic requirement of content analysis technique which includes a brief statement that spells out the constraints of the study. The current study considers the opinion which includes editorials and articles contents of Minorities' Press in Pakistan including Daily Aftab a Christian paper, Christian publication weekly Christian Voice, a Fortnightly publication Catholic Nageeb, a Monthly publication Shahdab, Monthly publication Kalam-e-Haq, a Quarterly publication Al-Mushir, a Daily publication Al-Fazal, a Monthly publication Khalid, a Monthly publication Ansaar Ullah, a Monthly publication Misbah, Monthly publication Prem Sagar, a Weekly publication Parsi Sansar n loke sevak and a Monthly publication Nafahat from September 2001to December 2006.

In mass communication research the unit of analysis is the thing which is having central value and is actually counted, this is the smallest element of a content analysis method but it is one of the most important in the research, in written content, the unit of analysis might be a single word or a symbol this may be a theme, a sentence or a single assertion about an area, or even an entire article or story (Wimmer, 1994). Unit of analysis in the study and unit of coding are editorials and articles on the Terrorism issue which are published in selected minorities' press cited above. The Terrorism issue is the focus of the study in hand. Terrorism issues includes 9/11 incident in the United States, post 9/11 time, the talibanization in the region, suicide attacks, bomb blasts, killings of innocent people and all kind of terrorism which exist. The directions for the study regarding terrorism will be determined as follows as positive which means If an item is against the terrorism, negative if an item is in favor of terrorism and neutral if an item discusses the causes of terrorism and give suggestions to eliminate the terrorism. Conceptualization of minorities' means non-Muslims citizen in Pakistan from different religions including Christians, Hindus, Ahmadis, Parsis, Bhai and Sikh etc. Press means the newspapers and magazines which belong to non-Muslim communities residing in Pakistan whereas terrorism includes 9/11 incident happened in United States, post 9/11 period, Talibanization, suicide bombings, bomb blasts and all kind of terrorism in Pakistan.

It is very hard for a researcher to conduct an ideal study so the limitations are also there as every research has always certain limitations which leaves space for further research or investigation. Here limitations may include that

the content analysis is frequently time-consuming, therefore, the researcher has taken time period from September 2001 to December 2006. Further the findings of this study are limited to the framework of the categories and definitions used in this study.

Data Analysis

Table 1: Comparative coverage of all Editorials of all the magazines and newspapers on Terrorism issue from September 2001 to December 2006

Newspapers/ Magazines	Frequency (Percentage)	Chi- Square	df.	P-Value
Aftaab	189 (9)	6.125	4	0.190
Christian Voice	11 (3)			
Catholic Naqeeb	0 (0)			
Shadab	8 (9)			
Kalam e Haq	2 (3)			
Al-Mushir	5 (8)			
Khalid	0 (0)			
Ansar ullah	0 (0)			
Monthly Misbah	0 (0)			
Prem Sagar	0 (0)			
Parsi Sansar n loke sevak	0 (0)			

Table 1 indicates that 215 editorials were published in minorities' press of Pakistan on Terrorism issue. The publication named Aftaab gave maximum coverage on the Terrorism issue that is 189(9%). The Christian publication Christian Voice gave 11(3%), 8(9%) was published in Shadab, Kalam e Haq gave 2(3%) whereas Al-Mushir 5(8%) coverage on the Terrorism issue. However the issue was not given any coverage by rest of the selected minorities' press including Catholic Naqeeb, Khalid, Ansaar Ullah, Monthly Misbah, Prem Sagar and Parsi Sansar n loke sevak.

Here Chi-square test was used in the study to find out the distribution of Terrorism Issue among selected press. The

results displayed no significant differences i.e. ($\chi^2=6.125$, $df =4$, $p=0.190$).

Table 2: Direction of the Editorials in all minorities' newspapers and magazines on Terrorism issue from September 2001 to December 2006

	N=3570	n	%	Positive (+)	%	Negative (-)	%	Neutral (o)	%
Terrorism		215	6	123	57	13	6	79	37

Table 2 shows that in minorities' press, editorials on terrorism issue were 215(6%) which includes 123(57%) positive editorials, 13(6%) negative whereas 79(37%) neutral editorials.

Table 3: Analysis of Variance

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	471.590(a)	2	235.795	.568	.571
Intercept	1185.256	1	1185.256	2.857	.100
Type	.000	0	.	.	.
Type_Treat	471.590	2	235.795	.568	.571
Error	14936.154	36	414.893		
Total	16593.000	39			
Corrected Total	15407.744	38			

Table 3 indicate that the selected press significantly deals the discussed issue differently in Terrorism issues showing ($P<0.001$). Similarly the significant differences were not there so were not observed among the selected types of treatments which include positive, negative and neutral directions

showing ($P > 0.05$). This shows that despite of the positive, negative and neutral directions in editorials were published equally.

Table 4: Comparative coverage of all articles of the minorities' press i.e. magazines and newspapers on Terrorism issue during September 2001 to December 2006

Newspapers/Magazines	Frequency (Percentage)	Chi-Square	df.	P-Value
Aftaab	81 (3)	8.824	6	0.184
Christian Voice	31 (3)			
Catholic Naqeeb	14 (6)			
Shadab	7 (6)			
Kalam e Haq	6 (1)			
Al-Mushir	14 (8)			
Daily Al-Fazal	0 (0)			
Khalid	0 (0)			
Ansaar ullah	0 (0)			
Monthly Misbah	0 (0)			
Prem Sagar	0 (0)			
Parsi Sansar n loke sevak	33 (6)			
Monthly Nafahat	0 (0)			

Table (4) indicates that on Terrorism issue 186(1%) articles were published in selected press. The publication named Al-Mushir gave maximum coverage to the Terrorism issue than rest of the press i.e. 14(8%) articles. Aftaab gave 81(3%) coverage, Christian Voice gave 31(3%) coverage, Naqeeb showed 14(6%), Shadaab presented 7(6%) on terrorism issue, Kalam e Haq gave 6(1%) whereas Parsi Sansaar and loke sevak gave 33(6%) articles on the terrorism issue. The

terrorism issue was not given worth by rest of the newspapers and magazines.

In the study Chi-square test was applied to find out the distribution of Terrorism Issue in minorities' press. The result shows that there was not significant differences as ($\chi^2 = 8.824$, $df = 6$, $p = 0.184$) among the distribution of Terrorism issue in selected minorities' press.

Table 5 Total directions of the articles in all the magazines and newspapers on Terrorism issue from September 2001 to December 2006.

N=20980	N	%	Positive (+)	%	Negative (-)	%	Neutral (o)	%
Terrorism	186	1	146	78	19	10	21	11

Table (5) shows that in minorities' press, there were 189(1%) articles on terrorism issue among which 146 (78%) were in positive direction, 19 (10%) were in negative direction and 21(11%) were in neutral direction.

Table 6: Analysis of Variance

Source	Type III Sum of Squares	df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Corrected Model	814.308(a)	2	407.154	2.720	.079
Intercept	887.077	1	887.077	5.926	.020
Type	.000	0	.	.	.
Type_Treat	814.308	2	407.154	2.720	.079
Error	5388.615	36	149.684		
Total	7090.000	39			
Corrected Total	6202.923	38			

Table (6) show that the selected minorities' press significantly treat differently in three selected types of Terrorism issues

showing ($P < 0.001$). Significant differences were not there among the selected types of treatment including positive, negative or neutral giving ($P > 0.05$). This shows that despite of the press positive editorials, negative and neutral editorials were published equally.

Discussion

The study under discussion indicates that the Minorities' Press in Pakistan has showed a lot of interest in the coverage of terrorism issue which has become a global issue after 9/11 incidents in the United States as the time period of this study is favorable due to the terrorist attacks in United States. The findings of the study show that on Terrorism issue 215(6%) editorials were given in the minorities' press of Pakistan including press from almost all major minorities groups. The newspaper Aftaab showed lot of interest while covering the terrorism issue resulting maximum coverage on the issue that is 189(9%) editorials, the Christian newspaper Christian Voice also showed great concern related to the issue under discussion and gave 11(3%) space in the publication, another publication Shadaab gave 8(9%) worth to the issue, results show that Kalam e Haq gave 2(3%) whereas Al-Mushir published 5(8%) editorials on the Terrorism issue. So minorities' press showed greater concern and interest related to the issue particularly the Christian publications. However the issue was not covered by the rest of the minorities' press. The three directions were there related to the study, the directions were there which showed that in Pakistani Minorities' Press, editorials on terrorism were 215(6%) among which 123(57%) editorials were in positive direction, 13(6%) were showing negative stance and 79(37%) editorials

were having a neutral stance. The analysis for the study show that a greater number of the editorials support the government's stance on the war against terrorism which was a hot issue of the time particularly the Christian newspapers among which Daily Aftaab has shown the more interest on the terrorism issue supporting the government standing on the war against terrorism. The results also showed that among the selected press the Ahmedis or Qadianis, Hindus, Parsis and Bhai's religions press have not given any worth to the terrorism issue in the editorials.

On Terrorism issue 186(1%) articles were given value showing that the publication Al-Mushir gave maximum coverage to the Terrorism issue that is 14(8%) articles, Aftaab gave 81(3%) articles, Christian Voice gave 31(3%) coverage, Catholic Nageeb gave 14(6%) articles, Shadaab published 7(6%) articles, Kalam e Haq gave 6(1%) worth and Parsi Sansaar n loke sevak presented 33(6%) articles on the terrorism issue. However Terrorism issue was not given worth by rest of the selected press. The direction wise results for the study in hand show that in Minorities' publications articles on terrorism were 189(1%) among which 146 (78%) were showing positive stance, 19 (10%) were showing negative stance whereas 21(11%) were in neutral direction.

The study concludes that among the selected minorities' press the Christian magazines and newspapers gave more coverage to the selected issue than rest of the minorities' press from other religions, they supported the government stance towards terrorism as whole country was facing the wave of terrorism during selected time period and on daily basis the bomb blasts and rest of the terrorist activities were being witnessed. A greater support witnessed by the minorities' press for the war against terrorism. The findings

shows that the Parsi newspapers has given coverage to the articles on terrorism but the other religions including Ahmedi, Hindu religion and Bhai's religions press has not given any coverage to the terrorism issue in their articles. The study showed that both the editorials and articles supported the government's view point on the war against terrorism and rest of the terrorism issues in the Minorities' Press of Pakistan in general whereas the Christian press in particular has strongly supported the Government of Pakistan stance in this regard. So, the frequency or the coverage of the editorials and articles which supports the government's stance on the war on terrorism is more than the editorials and articles which oppose the view point whereas addressing the terrorism issue in both the editorials and articles the spirit of a nationalist approach is strongly observed.

References

- Hoffman, B. (2006). *Inside Terrorism*. revised edition Columbia University Press, 2006
- Gerges, Fawaz A. (2005). *The Far Enemy: Why Jihad Went Global*. Cambridge University Press. ISBN 0-521-79140-5.
- Scheuer, M (2005). *Imperial Hubris*. Dulles, Virginia: Brassey's, Inc.. p. 9. ISBN 978-0-9655139-4-4
- UN Press Release (2001). SC/7158, Security Council, 4385th Meeting.

- Hanitzsch, T. (2004). "Journalists as Peacekeeping Force? Peace Journalism and Mass Communication theory." *Journalism Studies*, 5(4): 483-495. Ilmenau University of Technology, Germany.
- Charles, L. R. (2002). The Definition of Terrorism, *Analyses of Social Issue and Public policy*, (9-14)
- Richter, S. (1999). *Journalisten zwischen den Fronten*. Richter, Simone (1999) *Journalisten zwischen den Fronten*.
- Kriegsberichterstattung am Beispiel Jugoslawien, Opladen/Wiesbaden: Westdeutscher Verlag
- Watson, J. (1998a). *Media Communication - An Introduction and Theory and Process*. London, UK: MacMillan Press Ltd.
- Watson, J. (1998b). *Media Communication*. London: Macmillan Press Ltd.
- Wimmer, D.R. & Dominick, R.J. (1991). *Mass Media Research: An Introduction*. Belmont: Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- MeQuail, D. (1998). *Communication Theory - An Introduction. 3rd Edition*. London, UK: SAGE Publications.
- Dominick, J. R. (1996). *The Dynamics of Mass Communication. 5th Edition*. New York, USA: The McGraw-Hill Companies Inc.
- Kellner, Douglas (1992). *The Persian Gulf TV War*. Boulder, Co.: Westview Press.
- Tankard, J. W. (1992). *Communication Theories Origins Methods, and Uses in the Mass Media*. New York, USA: Long Group Ltd.

Wimmer, R. D. & Dominick, J. R. (1994). *Mass Media Research. 4th Edition*. London, UK: Wadsworth, Inc.

Wolfsfeld, G. (1999). *Media and Political Conflict: News from the Middle East*. Cambridge University Press.
<http://www.transnationalterrorism.eu/tekst/publications/WP4%20Del%206.pdf>